

# **The Journal of Cultural Perspectives**

**Biannual Research Journal**

**ISSN Print: 2789-0333**

**ISSN Online: 2789-0341**

# THE JOURNAL OF **CULTURAL PERSPECTIVES**



**AZEEM EDUCATIONAL CONFERENCE**

**Under the Supervision of**

**Azeem Educational Conference Regd. Islamabad**

### Editorial Board

| Sr. No. | Name                                    | Designation   |
|---------|---|---|
| 1.      | <b>Dr. Muhammad Azeem Farooqi</b>       | <b>Chief Editor</b> , The Journal of Cultural Perspectives  |
| 2.      | <b>Dr. Issac Land</b>                   | Professor, Department of History, Indiana University  |
| 3.      | <b>Dr. Ruipiug Ye</b>                   | Professor, Victoria University of Wellington  |
| 4.      | <b>Dr. Waqas Saleem</b>                 | Lecturer, Department of Anthropology, Quaid i Azam University   |
| 5.      | <b>Dr. Umer Hayat</b>                   | Associate Professor, Department of Islamic Studies, Govt. College University Faisalabad                     |
| 6.      | <b>Dr. Muhayyudin Hashmi</b>            | Chairman, Department of Seerat, Allama Iqbal Open University  |
| 7.      | <b>Dr. Khurram Shehzad</b>              | Assistant Professor, Department of English, National University of Modern Languages                         |
| 8.      | <b>Dr. Humayun Abbas Shams</b>          | Professor/Chairman, Department of Islamic Thought, History and Culture, Govt. College University Faisalabad |
| 9.      | <b>Dr. Himayat ullah Yaqubi</b>         | Assistant Professor, Department of History, Quaid i Azam University   |
| 10.     | <b>Dr. Altafullah</b>                   | Senior Research Fellow, National Institute of Historical and Cultural Research                              |
| 11.     | <b>Dr. Muhammad Baqir Khan Khakwani</b> | Chairman, Islamic Jurisprudence, Riphah International University, Islamabad                                 |
| 12.     | <b>Dr. Malik Ajmal Gulzar</b>           | Chairman, Department of English, AIOU, Islamabad  |
| 13.     | <b>Dr. Hafiz Muhammad Sajjad</b>        | Chairman, Department of Interfaith Studies, AIOU, Islamabad   |
| 14.     | <b>Dr. Muhammad Safdar Rasheed</b>      | Assistant Professor, Department of Urdu, AIOU, Islamabad  |
| 15.     | <b>Dr. Abdul Hameed Khan</b>            | Chairman, Department of Islamic   |

|  |               |   |
|--|---------------|---|
|  | <b>Abbasi</b> | Studies, Mohayyudin Islamic University, AJK |
|--|---------------|---|

### Advisory Board

| <b>Sr. No.</b> | <b>Name</b>                    | <b>Designation</b>  |
|----------------|--------------------------------|---|
| 1.             | <b>Dr. Tanvir Anjum</b>        | Chairperson, Department of History, Quaid i Azam University                                       |
| 2.             | <b>Dr. Humayun Abbas Shams</b> | Professor/Chairman, Department of Islamic Studies and Arabic, Govt. College University Faisalabad |
| 3.             | <b>Dr. Rao Nadeem Alam</b>     | Assistant Professor, Department of Anthropology, Quaid i Azam University                          |
| 4.             | <b>Dr. Jamila Aslam</b>        | Research Assistant, University of Oxford  |
| 5.             | <b>Dr. Isaac Land</b>          | Professor, Department of History, Indiana State University  |
| 6.             | <b>Dr. Fahad Ahmad Bishara</b> | Rouhollah Ramazani Chair in Arabian Peninsula and Gulf Studies, University of Virginia            |

### **Journal's Description**

The Journal of Cultural Perspectives - TJCP is a flagship, biannual, peer-reviewed journal of Azeem Educational Conference – AEC, which focuses on interdisciplinary, problem-oriented, contextual research of human culture. The editors welcome historical and empirical inquiries of indigenous knowledge, cultural processes grounded in normative attitudes to understand and improve society. The journal encourages critical research of comparative international practices to facilitate an exchange of knowledge and cultural meanings beyond traditional biases. Cultural Perspectives offers articles that investigate and analyze the impact of culture on different institutions of social order; articles that integrate approaches from the social sciences and humanities; articles on cultural sciences in the twenty-first century; review articles on published work, theoretical innovation, and methods; and special issues that examine urgent questions in the field.

### **Aims & Scope**

Cultural Perspectives is committed to the reinterpretation of culture. It publishes original research. Innovative, critical papers are given preference that interrogate old patterns and cultural infrastructures and further new theories. The journal does not publish papers that ignore the broader relevance of their investigation for an international readership.

### **Submissions Guideline**

Cultural Perspectives privileges diverse readership and research interests with a necessary focus on culture. It welcomes original, scholarly, unpublished, culture-oriented papers from scholars, practitioners, culturists, economists, curators, linguistics, conservators, diversity experts, lawyers, artists, performers, policy activists, literary experts, researchers of information, and social sciences based in Pakistan and elsewhere in the world. The papers should be sent to: [tjcp@aec.org.pk](mailto:tjcp@aec.org.pk) in a single MS Word file of no more than 3000 words, including an abstract of 150 words, 3-5 keywords, a bibliography, along with a short resume, and a statement that author guidelines have been followed. Tables, charts, graphs, and figures may be included in the manuscript with captions. APA Style 7th Edition should be followed. Spellings and punctuation should be used in American English (e.g., realize, organize, recognize). The Editorial Board initially reviews all submissions and shortlists papers that undergo the peer review process. The publications are contingent upon the feedback of the reviewers and recommendation by the Editorial Board.

### **Disclaimer**

TJCP does not endorse any of the ideas, opinions or thoughts proposed in the published articles. The opinions belong to the authors only.

### Contents

| <b>Sr. No.</b> | <b>Author(s)</b>                     | <b>Title</b>   | <b>Page</b> |
|----------------|--------------------------------------|--|-------------|
| <b>1.</b>      | <b>Muhammad Ali<br/>Farooqi</b>      | <b>Cultural Diplomacy: An Analysis<br/>of National Film and Cultural<br/>Policy of Pakistan</b>                        | <b>07</b>   |
| <b>2.</b>      | <b>Zarnab Dilshad</b>                | <b>Role of Media in Foreign Policy<br/>Formulation: A Cultural<br/>Perspective</b>                                     | <b>27</b>   |
| <b>3.</b>      | <b>Imran Khan, Dr.<br/>Amanullah</b> | <b>Resistance in Punjabi Poetry: A<br/>Case Study of Zia Regime</b>  | <b>43</b>   |
| <b>4.</b>      | <b>Tuba Azeem</b>                    | <b>The Politics of Indigenoussness of<br/>Med Fisherfolk of Pakistan:<br/>Their Cultural Rights in<br/>Perspective</b> | <b>62</b>   |
| <b>5.</b>      | <b>Qurat ul Ain</b>                  | <b>Conceptualizing Change: Fair and<br/>Lovely to Glow and Lovely</b>  | <b>73</b>   |

## **Cultural Diplomacy: An Analysis of National Film and Cultural Policy of Pakistan**

**Muhammad Ali Farooqi**

**National Institute of Pakistan Studies, Quaid-i-Azam University**

### **Abstract**

Culture plays a significant role in projection of the soft image of any nation. The modern world has shifted itself from traditional mode of diplomacy to less aggressive one which is also known as cultural diplomacy. The nations tend to play safe these days by not involving into conventional diplomacy tactics to influence other countries like promotion of film industry and cultural sites. The study analyses the case study of Pakistan and its first ever national film and cultural policy in comparison to India's cultural policy. The study is based upon the proceedings of National Artists Convention 2018 in which veteran Pakistani artists from the filled of film, television, drama, dance, theatre, music and visual arts gathered to propose a national strategy to exert and project the local talent, rich cultural traditions, wonderful archaeological sites and breathtaking landscapes to establish a soft image of Pakistan before the international audience. To what extent, the policy and goals were practical and achievable? and how did it manage to enact or function later? is discussed in the study along with the case study or model of the cultural policy of the neighboring country, India. The approach is critical and analytical. To conduct this

study, official declassified reports, documents, articles, books, interviews and relevant primary sources have been consulted.

**Keywords:** Culture, Cultural Policy, Film, Pakistan, India, Cultural Diplomacy, National Artists Convention, PNCA



## **Introduction**

Cultural diplomacy is a type of soft power and public diplomacy that includes the "exchange of ideas, information, art, language and other aspects of culture among nations and their peoples in order to foster mutual understanding"(Waller, 2009). It is a soft alternative to hard belligerent diplomacy. Exchange of cultural activities is used as a tool for cultural diplomacy. "The purpose of cultural diplomacy is for the people of a foreign nation to develop an understanding of the nation's ideals and institutions in an effort to build broad support for economic and political goals" (Maack, 2001). Cultural Diplomacy plays a vital role in achieving national security efforts (US Department of State, 2005). Richard T. Arndt, a former State Department cultural diplomacy practitioner, said "Cultural relations grow naturally and organically, without government intervention – the transactions of trade and tourism, student flows, communications, book circulation, migration, media access, inter-marriage – millions of daily cross-cultural encounters. If that is correct, cultural diplomacy can only be said to take place when formal diplomats, serving national governments, try to shape and channel this natural flow to advance national interests" (Waller, 2009).

Pakistan and India are neighboring countries. The geo-strategic location of both the countries makes them important players in the region and world politics as well. In past couple of decades, Pakistan has been badly affected by the wave of terrorism. It

has changed the country's image drastically and the country has failed to improve it. There are no serious steps been taken by the stakeholders in this regard. It gave negative impression of the country to the foreign world. On the other hand, a quite different picture is seen in the neighboring country. It has successfully portrayed itself as a peaceful country. The Bollywood film industry has found its popularity across the globe. Their movies are being watched regularly and being featured in renowned international film festivals. Bollywood movies are regularly streamed on big screens across the world whether it is Africa, US, Europe or even China.

### **Literature Review**

Cultural Diplomacy is a widely known phenomenon. There is plenty of literature available on this topic. However, the topic is less discussed with the reference to Pakistan. The purpose of this paper is to study the role of cultural diplomacy in the national security with reference to Pakistan. The topic has not been touched by the researchers as well. It is because; the Pakistani state has not shown any interest in this regard.

The study is mainly based upon annual reports of expenditures made on cultural activities of both the countries, Pakistan (Ministry of Finance, 2018) and India (Ministry of Culture, 2018). The latest annual report available on National Culture and Literary Heritage Division Pakistan is of 2016-17. It mainly highlights the events

and grants being allocated through the ministry in a year. The later years' reports have not been compiled yet. While on the other hand Indian Culture Ministry has published its annual reports on regular basis.

Most of the data, under consideration by the researcher, possess official reports and different studies being done by some organizations working for the cause of promotion of art and culture i-e UNESCO (2011), British Council (2014), Information and Culture Department Government of the Punjab (2017).

For primary source data, the minutes of the National Artists Convention 2018, compiled and noted by the researcher itself, is also part of this research. It is the firsthand experience of the researcher being part of the convention which resulted in the formation of the first National Film and Cultural Policy 2018. Furthermore, some declassified files of ministry of culture, extracted from National Documentation Wing and National Archives of Pakistan, related to the Film policy have also been consulted to conduct this study.

### **Methodology**

It is a qualitative research. The study is based upon reports published by ministries of culture of both the countries and some relevant studies on the topic by independent organizations. The approach is critical and analytical. To conduct this study, official

reports, documents, articles, books and some primary source are being carefully consulted.

#### Formation of National Film and Cultural Policy

Keeping the importance of cultural diplomacy in mind, Pakistan National Council of the Arts Islamabad which works under National History and Literary Heritage Division, organized a three day National Artists Convention from 24-26 February 2018. The aim was to formulate a national cultural policy for future. More than 500 artists from the fields of film, drama, TV, dance, music, theatre and visual arts participated in this three-day long convention where they discussed the existing issues to the artists and their respective fields. The recommendations were then discussed and proposed before Maryam Aurangzeb, the Minister of Information at that time, titled “Recommendations for Film and Cultural Policy at National Artists Convention, Pakistan National Council of the Arts Islamabad”.

The convention was attended by many renowned artists, belonging from film, TV, drama, theatre, radio, music, dance and visual arts. Most of the participants were legendary artists from their respective fields; Mustafa Qureshi, Qavi Khan, Syed Noor, Shan, Imran Tareen, Babra Shareef, Meera, Rehan Sheikh and Zeba Bakhtiar from Film Industry, Laila Zuberia, Rubina Ashraf, Haseena Moeen, Asma Butt, Firdous Jamal and Amaullah Nasir from TV and Drama industry, Sheema Kirmani,

Usamn Peerzada, Shahid Qayum Mirza, Rahat Khan and Ishtiaq Ahmed Atish from Theatre, Indu Mitha, Wahab Shah and Suhae Abro from Dance, Ustad Hamid Khan, Multanikar, Ahmed Ali Khan renowned composers from Music Industry, veteran Radio artist Kanwal Naseer and many visual artists from Visual Arts were part of this activity(Radio Pakistan, 2018). Moreover former Executive Director Lok Virsa, Dr. Fouzia Saeed, former Chairmna Pakistan Academy of Letters Prof. Dr. M. Qasim Bughio and Director Alhamra Arts Council Lahore Zulfikar Zulfi also present there (Urdu Point, 2018). In the three days of the convention, scores of suggestions were put forward by the above mentioned artists. After long discussions and debates following points were finalized which were later approved by the Information Minister, Ms. Aurangzeb. Hence the new Film and Cultural Policy was announced in the press conference at the closing session of the National Artist Convention on 26<sup>th</sup> February 2017 (Pakistan Today, 2018). Some of the highlights are as under,

- “Censor Board screening must be done without any irrelevant person’s presence.  
(Usman Pirzada)
- It is quite difficult for the distributor to cut a certain scene from the film at eleventh hour as recommended by the Censor Board. It must be informed well in time.

- The Censor Board should be centralized. And the film being approved by the board must be allowed to screen all over the country. Provincial Censor Boards should be annulled which makes it difficult for the film maker to get the separate approval from all the provincial bodies.
- Censor Board must consist of seasoned artists and critics from literary history background.
- Balanced distribution of slots for the Pakistani films in the Cinemas along with Bollywood and Hollywood productions especially in prime time.
- There should be a limit to foreign content (Hollywood and Bollywood movies) in the Pakistani cinema screens. (Rehan Sheikh)
- The government employees should not be allowed to do a co-production with the government projects.
- Foreign crews should be facilitated in NOC process. Creating an efficient one window operation for censorship clearance, NOC and Visas for the artists. Foreign mission of Embassies of Pakistan should facilitate the Pakistani artists abroad. (Mumtaz Hussain, New York)
- There should be a Museum of Film. Archives of movies, artists, records, and exhibitions should be established. Museum of Film should screen classics of

Pakistani Film industry on regular basis to promote the rich culture of Film in the country.

- Corporate sector must be encouraged to invest in Pakistani film industry. (Imran Tareen).
- National Film Development Corporation (NAFDEC) should be restored. New Film academy must be founded. Regional films should be given subsidies. (Syed Noor)
- Scholarship must be introduced by the government for the art-aspirant students. (Rehan Sheikh)
- The practice of banning the films must be avoided and there must be a logical reason given for not allowing a production the screens. (Qavi Khan)
- Filmmakers should be given free access to the country's cultural heritage sites for shooting in order to promote heritage of Pakistan to its audience nationally and internationally. (Unanimous)
- There should be a handsome budget allocated for the establishment of the Film academy and promotion on regular bases. (Unanimous)" (Personal Notes, 2018)

The new Film and Cultural Policy was warmly welcomed by the artists faculty in the country (Associated Press of Pakistan, 2018). In the light of above-mentioned

recommendations, the draft was sent to the Ministry of Information. Maryam Aurangzeb, the Minister of Information gave a briefing in the Standing Committee of the National Assembly on Information and Broadcasting. The minutes of the briefing are as under;

- The new Film and Cultural Policy will be made part of the Finance Bill 2018.
- Exemption of Sales Tax from Film-making equipment for ten years.
- Establishment of Finance Fund: to grant loans for making international level film and construction of cinema houses of up to 50 million rupees.
- Establishment of Artists Assistance Fund
- Setting-up of Film academy and Film-directorate.
- Exemption of Income Tax for the Cinemas which have fewer than 350 seats.
- Tax rebates and exemptions for the international film makers who would shoot 70% of the production in Pakistan and 30% in their own countries. (Jaberi, 2018).

In Pakistan unfortunately culture has been a priority especially political party. There is merely a mention of promotion of culture and any policy regarding its promotion. Historically, we find only one party, Pakistan Peoples' Party which took some



commendable steps to take the culture as a serious tool to promote the soft image of the country. Starting with an extension in the Ministry of Education with the formation of Culture Division to establish a cultural infrastructure in the country in 1970s. Lok Virsa, National Film Development Corporation (NAFDEC), National Book Foundation, Academy of Letters, National and Provincial Arts Councils were initiated in the country. After Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto, Zia ul Haq took altogether different approach. He took culture like something religion driven. “But it also took the People’s Party another twenty odd years to formally announce its first culture policy in the second term of Benazir Bhutto in the 1990s” (Personal Notes, 2018).

Under the dictatorship, culture was prioritized in Ayub Khan’s era. Being an ally of the western world, the government focused more on curtailing such institution or even creative people like artists, writers, poets and singers who had progressive approach. The right-oriented people were also faced resistance form the government. His emphasis was to find a more modernistic interpretation. “The vacuum that it resulted in was filled in by liberal thought and proponents of the free world. There was plenty of music, dance, poetry, novel and film as a consequence which was a-political and a-ideological (Personal Notes, 2018).”

Zia ul Haq took its cultural inspiration from Arab instead of neighboring Persia, which had strong traces in this region. The Arabized cultural construct had terrifying

consequences for Pakistan in later years. Zia's era has been identified as the dark times for the country as it faced worse black lash to the artist faculty of the country.

The rule of General Pervaiz Musharaf had some positives in this regard. His rule is entitled, 'enlightened moderation' (Personal Notes, 2018). He used culture as a tool to curb extremeism and promoting the soft image of the country. Musharaf provided more artistic expression freedom than before. Establishment of Pakistan National Council of the Arts is a commendable step by him. PNCA would hold large festivals of drama, music, dance and art exhibitions on regular bases. It also promoted national level competitions for the youth too.

“But, in the recent past, one has seen the over-the-top mixing of cultural expression with politics, making it part of a performance in the rallies of Tehreek-e-Insaf. As the politicians prepare to address the people, the scene is warmed up by the singers, vocalists, and DJs who happen to represent the younger lot in forms that espouse and are popular with the youth. Salman Ahmed has strummed his guitar, singing topical numbers, all very kitsch, truly representative of the society that we have become. The spectacle is inclusive of offering prayers on stage in full view of the crowds as part of an overall performance” (Personal Notes, 2018).

The government of Pakistan Muslim League (N) declared its culture policy in the dying days of its rule. Pakistan. It shows that PMLN did not take the seriousness of

the issue when it had time. It is worth mentioning here that the political parties must have a clear vision about such an important issue, cultural policy. Although it was a commendable step to initiate Pakistan's first National Film and Cultural Policy but it could not become that fruitful it could have been. The Pakistan *Tehreek i Insaaf*, who proceeded the PMLN, did same what political parties use to do. It did not implement the policy which could be a fortune-changer for the showbiz industry and soft image of the country.

The budget allocation for the promotion and culture is not satisfactory. It does not cater our modern challenges. If we see at the Finance budget of Pakistan, it is noticed that an amount of 681 million rupees was allocated for the cultural services under the Recreation, Culture and Religion head (see Figure 1 & 2), (Ministry of Finance, 2018). The figures show that religious affairs have more budget than the cultural affairs/activities. And the administration of Information, Recreation and Culture costs almost half the total amount i.e. 437 million rupees. This reflects government's priorities for its culture. On the other hand India has a total budget of 2600.85 Crore Indian Rupees for its Arts and Culture Ministry (see Figure 3), (Ministry of Culture, 2018). It shows how minute budget Pakistan is pouring into its Culture.

This neglect of government has cost Pakistan in the shape of bad image of the country internationally. On the other hand Indian showbiz industry is on boom and there is no looking back. While Pakistan is struggling with this issue, India is taking

Bollywood to a whole new level. Our dramas, film, theatre and related fields are not producing impressive stuff for the local and international market. There can be substantial difference seen in both Pakistan and Indian showbiz industry. A new trend of making historical movies is emerging in the neighboring country. With this new strategy India is creating a new distorted face of history and fascinating it with newly emerging Hindu supremacy in India by making movies on local heroes i.e. Padmavati, Tanhaji, Bahu Bali, Manikarnika (Jhansi ki Rani) Pani Pat (on battles of Pani Pat) etc.

### **Conclusion**

To conclude, it is worth mentioning that culture plays a significant role in soft image of any country. Cultural freedom makes a harmonious and more open society. Culture is the best ambassador of the country. Unfortunately, in Pakistan it has been under fire with debates like religion and culture or culture as a threat to faith etc. moreover our state also does not take it seriously. The poor policies of the government have resulted in rise of extremism and negative image of the country. It seems that our government is still confused in the above-mentioned debates and questions. However, with sound policies and legislation, Pakistan can achieve excellence in this field too. It is full of potential and zeal. It just needs government's attention and support. Pakistan has immense potential of tourism too due to its scenic beauty and rich heritage. The government should invest more for the promotion of

Art and Culture.it would automatically attract international market and tourist which will eventually boost up our economy.

The policies like National Film and Cultural Policy should be implemented by government without any prejudice as it was the first time when that big gathering of legendary, seasoned and professional sat for three days to discuss the future of cultural image of the country and devised a balanced charter of demand in the shape of a national policy. This type of conventions and debates should be continued for the national cause in order to cope with the modern challenges of diplomacy.

## References

*Annual Report 2018-2019*. (2018). Ministry of Culture,

India. <https://www.indiaculture.nic.in/annual-reports>

Associated Press of Pakistan. (2018, June 6). *Showbiz People Welcome National Film, Culture*

*Policy*. The Express Tribune. <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1729529/1-showbiz-people-welcome-national-film-culture-policy/>

*Cultural Diplomacy in Action*. (2005). US Department of State. [https://2009-](https://2009-2017.state.gov/pdcommission/reports/54256.htm)

[2017.state.gov/pdcommission/reports/54256.htm](https://2009-2017.state.gov/pdcommission/reports/54256.htm)

*Finance Budget 2018*. (2018). Ministry of Finance,

Pakistan. [www.finance.gov.pk/budget/Budget\\_in\\_Brief\\_2018\\_19.pdf](http://www.finance.gov.pk/budget/Budget_in_Brief_2018_19.pdf)

Jabri, P. (2018, April 19). *Film and Culture Policy will be Made Part of Finance Bill 2018*.

Business Recorder. <https://www.brecorder.com/2018/04/20/412979/film-and-culture-policy-will-be-made-part-of-finance-bill-2018-marriyum/>

Maack, M. N. (2001). Books and Libraries as Instruments of Cultural Diplomacy in

Francophone Africa during the Cold War. *Libraries & Culture*, 36(1), 58-

86. <https://doi.org/10.1353/lac.2001.0012>

Sarwat, A. (2018, June 3). *The Politics of Culture*. The News

International. <https://www.thenews.com.pk/tns/detail/565612-politics-culture-2>

Staff Reporter. (2018, March 18). *First-ever National Film, Culture Policy Widely Welcomed*.

RADIO PAKISTAN. <https://www.radio.gov.pk/13-03-2018/first-ever-national-film-culture-policy-widely-welcomed>

Staff Reporter. (2018, June 6). *Newly Approved Culture, Film Policy to Promote National*

*Identity*. Urdu Point. <https://www.urdupoint.com/en/showbiz/newly-approved-culture-film-policy-to-promot-364494.html>

Staff Reporter. (2018, February 27). *Mariyum Announces First-ever Film, Cultural Policy*.

Pakistan Today. <https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2018/02/27/mariyum-announces-first-ever-film-cultural-policy/>

Waller, J. M. (2009). *Cultural Diplomacy, Political Influence, and Integrated Strategy*.

In *Strategic influence: Public diplomacy, Counterpropaganda, and political warfare*. Institute of World Politics Press.

### **RECREATION, CULTURE AND RELIGION**

5.13 In budget 2018-19 an amount of Rs 9,242 million has been budgeted for Recreation, Culture and Religion. Overall estimates under this classification for 2018-19 are higher by 9.6% when compared with budget estimates 2017-18, while lower by 22.1% when compared with revised estimates 2017-18. The bulk of expenditure under this head has been earmarked for Broadcasting and Publishing, which is 76.7% of the total allocation. Details are given in Table-24 below:

**TABLE - 24**  
**RECREATION, CULTURE AND RELIGION**

| Classification   | (Rs in Million)   |                    |                   |
|--|-------------------|--------------------|-------------------|
|  | Budget<br>2017-18 | Revised<br>2017-18 | Budget<br>2018-19 |
| <b>RECREATION, CULTURE AND RELIGION</b>                  | <b>8,434</b>      | <b>11,866</b>      | <b>9,242</b>      |
| - Recreation and Sporting Services                       | 1                 | 1                  | 1                 |
| - Cultural Services                                      | 618               | 644                | 681               |
| - Broadcasting and Publishing                            | 6,483             | 8,124              | 7,091             |
| - Religious Affairs                                      | 959               | 2,724              | 1,032             |
| - Administration of Information,<br>Recreation & Culture | 373               | 373                | 437               |

Figure 1



**TABLE - 16**  
**CURRENT EXPENDITURE**

| Classification                      | (Rs in Million)   |                    |                   |
|-------------------------------------|-------------------|--------------------|-------------------|
|                                     | Budget<br>2017-18 | Revised<br>2017-18 | Budget<br>2018-19 |
| 1) General Public Service           | 2,553,633         | 2,977,275          | 3,340,431         |
| 2) Defence Affairs and Services     | 920,166           | 999,237            | 1,100,334         |
| 3) Public Order and Safety Affairs  | 109,604           | 119,417            | 132,289           |
| 4) Economic Affairs                 | 62,940            | 80,742             | 80,750            |
| 5) Environment Protection           | 1,141             | 1,228              | 1,261             |
| 6) Housing and Community Amenities  | 2,329             | 2,449              | 2,339             |
| 7) Health Affairs & Services        | 12,847            | 12,944             | 13,897            |
| 8) Recreation, Culture and Religion | 8,434             | 11,866             | 9,242             |
| 9) Education Affairs and Services   | 90,516            | 90,818             | 97,420            |
| 10) Social Protection               | 2,100             | 2,302              | 2,396             |
| <b>TOTAL:</b>                       | <b>3,763,709</b>  | <b>4,298,279</b>   | <b>4,780,359</b>  |

5.4 The bulk of expenditure falls under General Public Service. The expenditure against this head has been budgeted at Rs 3,340,431 million for 2018-19, which is 69.9% of current expenditure.

Figure 2

Figure 3

**Year-wise Budget Estimates and Expenditure of Culture after merger of Plan and Non-Plan**

| YEAR    | BUDGET ESTIMATES |         |         | EXPENDITURE \$ |         |         |
|---------|------------------|---------|---------|----------------|---------|---------|
|         | REVENUE          | CAPITAL | TOTAL   | REVENUE        | CAPITAL | TOTAL   |
| 1       | 2                | 3       | 4       | 5              | 6       | 7       |
| 2017-18 | 2661.79          | 76.68   | 2738.47 | 2476.70        | 53.80   | 2530.50 |
| 2018-19 | 2764.28          | 79.04   | 2843.32 | 2506.01        | 94.84   | 2600.85 |

# Upto 2003-04 capital budget of Ministry of Culture was reflected in the Detailed Demands for Grants of the Ministry of Urban Development

\$ includes expenditure on North- East Activities.

## **Role of Media in Foreign Policy Formulation: A Cultural Perspective**

**Zarnab Dilshad**

**National Defense University**

### **Abstract**

This paper explains the role of media in foreign policy formulation. It will also explain what role media plays in elaborating cultural perspectives as it is well acknowledged that media is the most significant contributor to social awareness. The impact of media is more robust than anything else in the general public. People are very responsive to this source of communication. Media can change and groom society by showing sensible and responsible content. Media has an extreme effect on culture. The more prominent approaches media for certain gears. Employing this media can play its effective and efficient role in the formulation of foreign policy and culture. It is through the media culture of the state that can be publicized globally. This paper elucidates how media shows the optimistic appearance in foreign policy structure and through this what will be the cultural perspective and attitude to the world.

**Keywords** Media, Foreign policy, Culture, Formulation, Society, Awareness, Media Theories, Foreign Policy Theories

## **Introduction**

Today's media has appeared worldwide as an essential factor not only a source of communication but also an important factor in international relations. It has proved to be a critical aspect that influences the affairs between nations and guides them in a given direction.

According to Noam Chomsky, “the mainstream role of media in the (Chomsky, 1992) United States of America is restrained by the leading and distinct people like legislators and representatives. They all work on same scheme and affiliation for cooperation and sponsoring of each other’s well-being and influence.” By controlling the information provided to the public, it is possible to mold the people who are not exposed to other sources of information and news.

In Pakistan, the ownership pattern of the media has been quite distinctive from that in the United States or other developed states. Nonetheless, the press has operated on the propaganda model regarding some fundamental issues, especially on foreign policy questions.

Before the role of the media on foreign policy formulation of Pakistan and cultural perspective is analyzed, it is necessary to realize the foreign policy and Culture itself. It is identified that foreign policy is a complicated and perplexed process. It does not evolve in a vacuum. There are many internal determinants and external determinants in which

media is also a significant internal factor. There may be a strapping relationship between media and foreign policy formulation.

Media has emerged as a vital emblem and means to spread awareness and information in the states. Besides, the media has also appeared as a "strategic actor" in making and shaping public opinions (Mintz & DeRouen, 2010) and narrative building through different channels.

Moreover, it provides direction to the public on foreign policy and cultural issues, which contributes to the foreign policy formulation process of different states. It brings out salient features of the issue through efficient management. Three different kinds of media are print media, electronic media, and social media.

Now a day, electronic media and social media are more prevalent among people in Pakistan. In Pakistan, the media role has been undermined because ruling political parties are suppressing it in different establishment periods. The media in Pakistan earlier was broadcasting only some government channels, which did not play their role effectively. At that time, there were no institutions or sturdy laws for broadcasting substance against the government.

But, of course, at that time, broadcasting was limited. Consequently, our Culture was sophisticated and elegant. By the passage of time, our media groomed the audience and

general public somehow, forgetting and slowly losing our actual cultural and traditional values. And behind this, there may be many causes.

Media in western states is focusing on awareness, grooming, entertainment and using this means of communication for educational and political purposes. By this, it can be said that media is showcasing its Culture, tradition, and also in diplomatic ties between states. "There are three categories in which media and foreign policy can be explained and analyzed and that are (Ejaz, 2012); manipulative/monolithic/advocative; adversarial; and indifferent."

Developed nations media and mainly the U.S. media have been careful, improvise, strict and uncompromising, sophisticated as well. To the extent that, the Pakistani media, reporters and journalists are observed and perceived, media has remained detached and unbiased towards foreign policy as for the reason that Pakistani media has been under strict government control.

Media in other developed states plays its efficient and effective role as the "fourth pillar" of foreign policy and public opinions' as it is in direct coordination (Ejaz, 2012) and interaction with the public on different views in addition to decisions in Pakistan the position of media is not very vigorous. The media, in some way, want to execute its responsibility as the fourth pillar, but it is not allowed that much to perform its duty well. The media role if discussed in the case of Pakistan is and should be confrontational in

democratic or military regimes. One is, in fact, the opposition to autonomous forces in government.

Eventually, in Pakistan one and the other either democracy or military rules were tyrant and attained supremacy through extraneous unconstitutional means. These both regimes held and strained the media. However, this surely, arose the gap and left void as, the leaders realize that reporting is critical of their own rule. Then they cracked down on media. Both regimes, either democratic or dictator, endeavored to publish news and affairs in their interests. They forgotten about basic culture, values and principles of our state. Media was regulated by hook or by crook, and private channels were established lately.

If the emancipation of speech in media is observed from Pakistan's perspective, then media in Pakistan was not liberated. There were only a few government channels that were broadcasted to the people. Media got actual and realistic sovereignty in the supremacy of Pervaiz Musharraf. After that, many media channels started posting. An institution was established, and people began bringing awareness about their state affairs and other regional states' matters. By following that, people made their opinions regarding government, its performance, and policies.

Media and foreign policy relationships and their perspective in Culture are discussed in two parts; the first part talks about the role of media in foreign policy and Culture and

gives a conceptual framework for better understanding. The second part describes media issues in Pakistan.

### **Literature Review**

Culture and media are universally acknowledged subjects and areas. Many research and exploration have been made on these topics. Because media and culture are somehow interrelated as through media the culture of one state is shown to the other world. Although there is dearth of literature finding and critiques on foreign policy and its association with media. In Pakistan, media and foreign policy stratagem is not discussed thoroughly.

“Study of the media and foreign policy should consider the multifaceted nature of the phenomenon by focusing on these dimensions; such as public views, foreign policy culture, technological advancement, (Mowlana, 1997) by viewing situation of security and peace, monetary and trade as determinant of foreign policy and most importantly culture and information as another factor of foreign policy.

"Communication media is influential (Merill, 1991) in generating, spreading, and amending images of other states and notable global leaders."

Media as source of political, cultural and societal communication can transform national images and perception that not only relates with different segments of society but also provides a podium and power of speech to community for sharing of views. Media has



become a prevailing and authoritative establishment that affects political policies and culture through different extents either entertaining, documentaries or bulletins.

Media sketches political maps of the world in contemporary times. Media actually changed public opinions and briefed (Cohen, 1963) individuals what to think about and share views about tradition, culture and foreign policy. This well-known citation of Cohen explains the agenda-setting role of media

“Media and foreign policy are entwined and associated with one another in such a way that data and evidence shared on these channels and platforms give confidence to community to share their views and opinions about policies. Global media has made (Weiss, 1966) communication prompt and instant, and television has cashed on the saying of 'seeing is believing.'”

Understanding these citations shows that media is the only source for showcasing the culture and foreign policy formulation aspects. To formulate foreign policy, culture and information are most substantial and significant.

### **Cultural Perspective**

Culture is people's characteristics and living style based on their religion, language, state, and region. In contrast, cultural perspective states how the idea or impression of an individual is shaped. Every part, state, and religion have its own Culture. People live conferring to their cultural perspective. Culture is representative means of connection and

relations. It is the main source of depiction of traditions and values. It is through culture that people of different societies and regions coordinate with each other. Some of its views includes ability, learning, awareness, aptitudes, principles, values, orders, and motivations. The context and spirits of the emblems of culture are accomplished and knowingly spread in a society through its institutes and organizations. The research was drifted out on the conventional patterns for social sciences, i.e., descriptive and analytical both approaches to assess progress and arrived at a conclusion. Review of existing literature on mass media in Pakistan and its role in foreign policy formulation and especially its effect on Pakistan's culture available online and publications sources were consulted to get a comprehensive perception on the effect of media, foreign policy and culture.

### **How Media Affect Culture**

Media has a direct influence upon Culture. Many people depend upon media for entertainment, news, and other communication means. Media is completely unrestricted in some states, and it broadcasts its particular content by its own will. One way or another, this content is in favor of the public according to their cultural perspective.

Some state's media is still under strict watchdog and regulatory authority because of that media cannot express and transmit facts content without prior information. Then there

becomes a massive revolt in the field of media. The quick and fast progress of media has massive impact on transmission of cultural exchange.

Traditional media back years had some limitations and restrictions to convey Information and evidence. But new media has brought innovation and revolution in digital communication.

The whole world has been connected through digital and social media. Earth has become a global village. The satellite communication is very informative and revealing for everyone. People of one state can watch and analyze the culture, tradition, and news events of other states.

The media can also broadcast false propaganda about one state. This incorrect information ruins and causes disintegration among states. There is another medium of communication and information among people, and that is online Culture. This is somehow the new means of media cultural development. Online Culture is increasing because of this massive media advancement.

Networked and internet cultural information is without national borders and regions. People share equality, freedom of speech, and information. Anybody can share stuff whensoever they want. Via media and Culture, foreign policy of any state can be determined. Media and culture bring convenient and efficient communication, transmission, and exchange of people's thoughts, views and ideas. People share

judgements and opinions about government decisions and choices. Now a days, social media is spreading so rapidly that everyone shares their ideas about someone's decisions. Somehow, it is causing harm to individuals' life. The situation has become effortless for the public to share views about other forums like foreign policy issues since foreign policy decisions are imperative for building ties and alliances amongst states.

The media act as cultural socialization agents in this new era. The impact of media has had not only on individuals' activities, cultural, and societal perceptions. It is due to the speedy growth of the television industry and social media and its dominant role in daily life.

Media telecast different cultural, religious, political, social, and entertainment programs for the viewers. Over time, the viewership is also increased with enormous media evolution. Media has caused an intense shadow on the public. Many people depend on media for certain global news and entertainment programs. Media is the sole establishment for worldwide programs by different means and technological advancements.

Meanwhile, the use and effect of media have grown, scholars have come advanced and put forward theories regarding an increase in advancement and its increasing results and consequences. There exist some cultural and sociological perspectives theories that are Direct Effects Theory and Limited Theory

Rendering to direct effects approach media has a direct influence on general community and society. "Several media entertaining programs have influence on young individuals as they are exposed to this development (Orbe, 2013) and expedition and it is causing negative and harmful ramifications.

According to a limited theoretical perspective, media has limited and little influence on the general public. "People are prone and susceptible towards media, but prefer to follow programs (Orbe, 2013) particularly concerning their own cultural discernments. As, many individuals are constant and persistent with their own prevailing beliefs, culture, customs and values. Some people are strict about choosing of specific programs. This shows media somehow has limited effect on individuals."

It relies on community and society what they prefer to watch and perceive through these media programs. Most of the public pay attention to political, religious, and cultural entertaining and related programs. These programs build a different mindset of people towards their traditions and values. Media airs various state programs like in Pakistan Indian programs are so watched that Indian Culture penetrated our children and youth that they were adopting their Culture, traditions, and values. But for now, the media has stopped airing Indian programs, and people left watching those programs.

In Pakistan, electronic as well as social media is getting acclaimed, particularly among teenagers and young individuals. "Social media in Pakistan (Kugulmen, 2012) as a

communication tool is used in five ways; breaking stories ignored by traditional media; mobilizing people for social and other campaigns; promoting and coordinating humanitarian aspects of issues and problems; activist for social causes; and accelerating communication between politicians and their publics.” Meanwhile there is a booming progression of television channels in Pakistan and now electronic media enjoying a great nuance of permission and independence, the audience usually gratifies their informative needs from these channels. Social media is mainly used to socialize; therefore, the role depends upon its usage patterns either for progressive or regressive purposes. Its role depends upon its use if people uses this mean of communication for getting information and increase in knowledge then this medium is very informative, educational and instructive.

In the stage of development and era of new media, correspondence and intercommunication has been increased and correlative especially the custom and practice of computer related communication. (Pavlik, 1996). Since, the new media has emerged the direction track of mass media has been altered from only delivering from small community to large community audiences. Media has actually the power and authority to influence culture and foreign policy, the era of new media has accelerated the process.

With the advancement of technology, interdependency (Couvering,2003) enhanced the control over the onlookers. New advancements in media give the impression of suspension and disruption of old media.

This research is significant because it is timely in the new informational era into which the people are approaching. The rapidity of transformation in the information age means that the relevance, accessibility, dimensions, and regularity of media coverage will increase and may affect the culture and foreign policy decisions. Individuals and policymakers will be aware of this change and the effect, if any, that it will have, an effect on their choices. In addition, this study is significant to the public, whose right is to know and understand how media coverage can influence decisions made by their elected leaders. Furthermore, this research study is critical and important as many researchers had not studied the relationship between media, culture, and foreign policy. Media and its relationship with culture, and foreign policy is delicate, subtle and complicated.

### **Conclusion**

There is a connection and association between media, foreign policy, and cultural perspectives. Media has a significant impact and influence on people. The general public is relying on media and its transmission. Now, here the role of media is compelling. It is the responsibility of the media to play its role efficiently and effectively concerning transmission and telecast content.

The media should broadcast content regarding cultural, religious, and traditional values. Through media, the public, especially young individuals, gain inspiration and motivation and then implement it in their daily lives. There are many researchers conducted

regarding media and culture, but they were not related to foreign policy. There is a shortage of literature concerning media, Culture, and foreign policy formulation, especially in Pakistan, since media mainly focuses on entertainment programs.

Furthermore, media should focus on educational, informative, constructive, and technological advancement to develop focused, attentive and deep learning and learn about their culture and perception well.

Culture is an umbrella term which comprehends the social behaviors, norms and values of any state society. Cultural attributes of Islamic states are very distinct and have particular values and ideologies as compared to western states.

Foreign policy should be decisive and significant regarding the state's cultural and societal perceptions. Because alliances, ties, links, and narratives are built according to the state's cultural and traditional values. Media consumers must develop media literacy. Media literacy is the mere understanding of media programs, their operation, and their programs. It will be instrumental and convenient for the general public aimed at knowing media.



## References

Cohen, B. (1963). *The Press and Foreign Policy*. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press. Quoted in Charles R. Berger and Steven H. Chaffee, eds., *Handbook of Communication Science* (Newbury Park, Calif.: Sage, 1987), 105.

Couvinger, E. V. (2003). *Media Power on the internet: Towards a theoretical framework*. Paper at the Seminar for Media Communication and Culture, London School of Economics. Retrieved from <http://nms.sagepub.com>

Eijaz, Abida. (2012). *Media Affecting Upon or Affected by Foreign Policy: The Case of Pakistan*. *Journal of Alternative Perspectives in the Social Sciences*. Volume 5 No 1, 74-95.

Hulme, Simon J. (1996). *The Modern media: The impact on foreign policy*. (Graduate Thesis)

Kugelman, M. (2012). *Social media in Pakistan: Catalyst for communication, not change*. NOREF Report. Retrieved from [http://www.peacebuilding.no/var/ezflow\\_site/storage/original/application/70df3ab24b007358a91879dfd3354e96.pdf](http://www.peacebuilding.no/var/ezflow_site/storage/original/application/70df3ab24b007358a91879dfd3354e96.pdf)

Lippmann, W. (1922). *Public Opinion*. New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction Publishers.

Livingston, Steven (1997, June) *Clarifying the CNN Effect: An Examination of Media Effects According to Type of Military Intervention*. Research paper, Harvard University, J. F. Kennedy School of Government.

Merrill, J. C. (1991). *Global journalism: Survey of International Communication* (2nd ed.). New York: Longman.

Mintz, A., & DeRouen Jr, K. (2010). *Frontmatter*. In *Understanding Foreign Policy Decision Making* (pp. I-Vi). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Mowlana, H. (1997). *The media and foreign policy: A framework of analysis*.

Malek, A. (Ed.), *News media & foreign relations: A multifaceted perspective*. Norwood, NJ: Ablex Publishing Co.

Naveh, Chanan. *The Role of the Media in Foreign Policy Decision-Making: A Theoretical Framework*. *Conflict & Communication Online*, Vol. 1, No. 2, 2002 (pp: 3-4). [www.cco.regenerationonline.de](http://www.cco.regenerationonline.de)

Orbe, Mark P. (2013). *Media and Culture: The "Reality" of Media Effects.*, *Inter/Cultural Communication: Representation and Construction of Culture*, (pp. 243). Sage Publications, Inc. <https://www.doi.org/10.4135/9781544304106>

Parkash Chander & Prem Arora. *International Relations*. Bombay: Cosmos Book hive (P) Ltd.

Pavlik, J. (1996). *The new media technologies: Cultural and commercial perspectives*. Boston: Allyn & Bacon.

Weiss, T. G. (1999). *Sanctions as a Foreign Policy Tool: Weighing Humanitarian Impulse*. *Journal of Peace Research*, Vol. 36, No. 5, pp. 499

## **Resistance in Punjabi Poetry: A Case Study of Zia Regime**

**Imran Khan, Dr. Amanullah**

**Department of History, Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad**

### **Abstract**

The resistance literature throughout the world has always been taken as a force that may drive and shape the minds of the readers to resist the oppression of the cruel forces of the society. The poets with themes of resistance feel the pulse and palpitation of the society, try to diagnose the intensions behind the cruel minds that ruthlessly suppress the helpless masses and while focusing on the remedies, prescribe the resistant passion and energy to the readers. This resistance poetry may help the readers to build a consciousness against this oppression, cruelty and social injustice. The Punjabi literature especially the Punjabi poetry since the epic age of Mahabharata and Ramayana has always been remained critical to the oppressive forces whether local or foreign and focused to develop a temperament of resistance among the readers against these undesirous forces. This paper traces the elements of resistance in Punjabi poetry and critically analyzes resistant themes of the Punjabi poetry which was written during the martial regime of Zia-ul-Haq. It also investigates the factors that enforce the poets to write with resistance themes and unearth the feelings of the oppressed against these breath-halting forces. The present study examines all the readily available Punjabi resistance poetry of Zia Regime and explores

the various strains of resistance and tries to align it with the historical tradition of resistance in Punjabi literature.

**Key Words:** Resistance, Literature, Poetry, Martial Regime, Oppression,

### **Resistance in Punjabi Poetry: A Case Study of Zia Regime**

Resistance means the ability to stand against and to oppose something un-desirable. It is the part of human consciousness that one resists against unwanted things. On the other hand literature anticipates life. It talks about man in interaction with man and society. So resistance literature is the exposure of man's this very opposition towards oppression, cruelty and social injustice. It is an obvious fact that a poet is always close to the heart of the general masses. He can communicate positively what none other can. Out of this reason Vladimir Mayakovski says,

Only one thing to me is important:

That there be poets,

Many excellent, different poets! (Rosenberg, ed. 1966, 3)

Alexander Pope, the renowned poet of the 18<sup>th</sup> century England in his popular work *An Essay on Man* says,

Know then thyself, presume not God to scan,

The proper study of Mankind is Man (Grant, ed. 1950, 121).

The history of literature shows that it has always been taken as a tool by the creative minds of the time to reform the follies and frivolities of the society. Renaissance literature may be taken as a relevant case of resistance literature in Europe. It revised the social, political, economic, cultural and religious phenomenon almost of the entire Europe. That's why 'the men of the Renaissance thought of their time as one in which mankind changed fundamentally (Hale, 1965, 11).' In addition to this, Geoffrey Chaucer, the social historian of Medieval England, in his *Prologue to the Canterbury Tales* unmasks the corruption of the religious class in a resistant tone when he says, 'if gold ruste what shal iren doo (Pollard, ed. 1960, 18)?' One of the classic works of literature in West is Homer's *Iliad* in which he depicts the story of resistance on part of Troy. Hector- the brave heart of Troy-chooses to die with honor than to live with the shame. He spoke to Achilles;

Then welcome Fate!

'Tis true I perish, yet I perish great:

Yet in a mighty Deed I shall expire,

Let future Ages hear it, and admire! (Pope, tr. 1965, 500)

Besides, the resistance of Spartacus in south Italy (73-71) (Grant, 1992, 120-123) influenced a strong slave uprising against the Roman Republic and gave the hope of freedom to his fellow gladiators. Socrates, the renowned Greek philosopher, also resisted the injustice and opted for the bowl of poison than life. He told to the jury, ‘as long as I draw breath and am able, I shall not cease to practice philosophy (Grube, tr. 1975, 32).’ Euripides-the Greek tragedian-was the one who was always resistant to the established discourse. To him ‘the ancient and the modern critics view as the iconoclastic and unconventional dramatist.’ (Storey & Allen, 2005, 131)

The Punjabi poetry since ages is replete with the theme of resistance. The songs of resistance in Punjabi literature, date back to *Mahabharata* and *Ramayana*, and then comes the legends of *Raja Rasalu* (VI-V centuries) which were succeeded by Nath Movement (VIII-X Centuries) and the *Var* literature of the time, then come the *Bhakti* poets with the voice of resistance. This voice was further carried by the Sufis of the Punjab from Baba Fareed to Mian Muhammad Bakhsh along with Baba Nanak and Sikh Gurus’ poetic work. The *Vars*, *Kissas* and *Satire* from the 13<sup>th</sup> century to the advent of British Raj conceded this tradition and promoted it among the poets of the Colonial era. The folk literature of the Colonial period celebrates the heroes of the Punjab as the resistant souls against the cruel authority of their time.

Shafqat Tanveer Mirza in his book *Resistance Themes in Punjabi Literature* confesses the reality that, ‘the massacre of Jallianwala Bagh shook the whole of the sub-continent

and the resistance put up against the Rowlatt Act by the Punjab was unprecedented during the first quarter of the 20<sup>th</sup> century (Mirza, 1992, 42).’ Hafizur Rehman in the introduction of his book *Resistance Literature* says, ‘the exercise of inhuman control over a section of people.....gives birth to a literature of defiance (Zaman & Rehman, 2009, 18).’

Among these poets the most eminent one are Bulleh Shah, Shah Muhammad, Mian Muhammad Bukhsh, Khawaja Ghulam Farid, Bhai Vir Singh, Kripa Sagar, Dhani Ram Chatrik, Kartar Singh Kalaswalia, Diwan Singh Kalepani, Giani Gurmukh Singh ‘Musafir’, Mohan singh, Avtar Singh Azad, Darshan Singh ‘Awara’, Harinder Singh ‘Rup’, Ustad Daman and Faiz Ahmed Faiz, Amrita Pritam, Harbhajan Singh, etc. Along with, these poets much folk literature was produced during the colonial period in eulogizing and honoring the freedom fighters of the War of Independence (1857).

This spirit of resistance in Punjabi literature seems to be enlivened during military regimes in Pakistan. Rasheed Amjad starts his introduction to *Mazahmati Adab:Urdu* with the words,

Resistance is the central tradition of Pakistani literature . . . The third martial law was immoral, unconstitutional, and unreasonable rather was a rebellion against the Constitution of 1973. It was the reason that the reaction against this martial was really intensive. (Amjad, 1995, 21)

This study intends to analyze the Punjabi resistance poetry which was written during the Zia Regime. The researcher tries to unearth that how Zia regime particularly saw the height of this literary resistance. Fakhar Zaman in his foreword to *Resistance Literature* writes, ‘The imposition of martial law in 1977 and the martyrdom of Prime Minister Zulfikar Ali Bhutto are two tragedies which have influenced our national life at every level.’ (Zaman & Rehman, 2009, 15) These two tragedies not only changed the political atmosphere of the country but also stirred a hefty reaction among the literary circle of the time. Their writings carved a new pattern of thoughts. They consciously took it as their historic responsibility to document the oppression and cruelty of military government for the future generations. The poets of the time thought, ‘the crusade for freedom and egalitarianism and the new awareness to stand steadfast against repression constitutes the manifesto of our future.’ (Zaman & Rehman, 2009, 15)

The literary creativity of that time, ‘marched shoulder to shoulder with those protesting politically against violence, cruelty and oppression.’ (Zaman & Rehman, 2009, 18). An analysis of the Punjabi poetry of Zia regime explicitly highlights the themes of oppression, suppression, fear, women’s emotional suffocation, check on freedom of thought and expression, control over all resources etc. Saleem Jahangir in his poem, *Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto* says,

*Na tun jaane na mein jana*



*Kaihi maut aey kaun aey moya* (Arif, ed. 1995, 34)

Only we didn't know about it: You and I

Who died there? (Zaman & Rehman, 2009, 355)

Saleem Jahangir is questioning that who died with the death of Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto? Is it the death of Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto or General Zia ul Haq or the death of democracy in the country or the death of trust, confidence or personal freedom? He further says,

*Akhan wale sachiyān gallān*

*Lokaan nu na cha'nge lagan* (Arif, ed. 1995, 34)

The people who tell the truth

Are seldom liked by men (Zaman & Rehman, 2009, 355)

He means that it's the future that would decide who died at that particular time. There is a Chinese proverb, 'The flowers of all the tomorrows are in the seeds of today.' (Mansoor, ed. 148) Jahangir in another poem extends the theme in this way,

*Kha ge sooraj pa ge raat*

*Jammi janj gernail jamaat*

*Bandian di bhal ker na murshte talash ker* (Arif, ed. 1995, 35)

They have swallowed the sun, and brought about the night.

In the wedding has arrived the General with the men!

Look for real men

And don't go for the puppets, (Zaman & Rehman, 2009, 358)

They would search for the puppets now because true men do not compromise on their freedom. John Milton in his masterpiece *Paradise Lost* says,

To reign is worth ambition, though in hell:

Better to reign in hell than serve in heav'n. (Bush, ed. 1966, 218)

Shuja Nawaz in his book *Crossed Swords: Pakistan, its Army, and the Wars Within* writes, 'The imposition of martial law by Zia was meant to be short lived. Swearing by the Muslim credo of *La illah illallah Muhammadur Rasul Allah*, he promised elections within 90 days.' (Nawaz, 2008, 359) Later on he gave up his promise in these words,

It is not in the Quran nor has it been revealed to me that elections will be held on October 18 and nothing will happen thereafter (Nawaz, 2008, 359).

Yusuf Hassan, another Punjabi poet, goes ahead in protest. In his poem *kabitt* (A Sorrowful Song), he says,

*Kinna piya nera ethe*

*Kehra such jooth mithe*

*Chaok vich chor jithe*

*Sa'ad sadaaonda*

*Sukh da na sa'ah liya*

*Khola hoya ghar keihya*

*Mur murk on piya*

*Annhiyan machaaonda*

*Deenh saade vehre dhukke*

*Raat da haner mukke*

*Zaaliman da hath rukke*

*Shehr kurlaaonda* (Arif, ed. 1995, 70)

It is pitch dark all around, we can neither find falsehood nor truth.

In darkness the thieves have

Become honest men.

We haven't heaved a sigh of relief

In our house, who has raised these despicable cries?

When will the day appear and bring

An end to the dark night?

When will the hand of tyrants come to stop?

The city has become a fearsome cry! (Zaman & Rehman, 2009, 383)

The same idea of 'thief' is used by Nasreen Anjum Bhatti, another Punjabi poetess, in her poem *Kaafi* as 'uninvited guests'. She writes,

*Laghre ander kon prohna*

*Wasde kothe ka'an* (Arif, ed. 1995, 67)

Who is the guest in the room?

The crow is on the roof!<sup>1</sup> Come, let us dance! (Zaman & Rehman, 2009, 330)

Then she proceeds ahead and says,

*Okar das karor, dise doori doori*

*Doori ain hazoori nakayye dham po.* (Arif, ed. 1995, 67)

How long is the journey!

Yet what's far off is nothing less than his presence; face to

face come, let us dance (Zaman & Rehman, 2009, 330)!

It's hard to challenge the ways of the dictator but still she is in hope that despite of the length of the journey someday one would achieve the goal. Here she seems to follow the diction of Khushal Khan Khattak that,

The night traveler should look for the dawn hour

There may appear the morning star

One should never lose hope

The rain falls ultimately upon a dry pasture (Rehman, tr. 2016, 19).

Shaista Habib, another Punjabi poetess, strengthens Nasreen Anjum Bhatti's above said idea that oppression and check on freedom leads to resistance. She in her poem, *Meri Hoond* (My Being) raises her defiant voice in this way,

*Mein neri mitti nh haan, jhide oper her koe per rakh k tur jave*

*Mein ta'an uggi ghaah haan, peran heith madholi javaan fer v sar ucha rakhaan*

*Mein te hawa haan*

*Her than ute upper eder uder, her aik sa'a de ander jeevan*

*Mein koe bacha nh haan, jinhoon chand mar k maan piyo chup kra den*

*Meriyan do wadiyan eadiyan akhan ni, te sochan lai damagh v ae*

*Mein tali te lakeeri hoe kismat di rekha nh haan*

*Mein te aap kalamkar haan, apna nizam khud tayar ker sakdi haan*

*Mein te Hubba Khatun aan, Jameela Bohri, Laila Khalid haan*

*Apni hoond, apniyan likhtaan vich azaadi de geet gaondi haan*

*Jithe v koe zulm kamae methu bach k na javae (Arif, ed. 1995, 40)*

I'm not dust which everyone can trample and walk away

I'm grown grass, even if I am rumpled under feet

I keep my head high.

I am the wind,

Everywhere, above, here, there

I live in every breath.

I am not some child whom mother and father slap into silence

I have two large eyes, very large eyes---and for thinking, a mind.

I am not a line of destiny drawn on the palm.

I myself a writer, I can create my own way

I am all the heroines this world has known

My own being; in my writings I sing songs of freedom

Wherever anyone indulges in tyranny, cannot escape me. (Zaman & Rehman, 2009, 370)

The idea is being a poetess she believes in the power of the pen and resolute enough to express herself boldly without any dictation. Amjad Ali Shakir, a well-known resistant poet of the time, very aptly uses the image of 'Boot' in his poem with the title *Boot da Tasma*.

*Char chufere hanera ghup*

*Te her passé ae doohngi chup*

*Bas ik bhare boot da tasma*

*Khir khir hasda*

*Gallan karda*

*Nazreen aave*

*Sunya jaave* (Arif, ed. 1995, 16)

Deep darkness is everywhere

Followed by deep silence

Only

A heavy shoe's lace is

Smiling

Talking

Seen by everyone

Listened by everyone

Fakhar Zaman, in his poem, *Aeih Kon?* very critically questions the role of military.

*Aeiy kon ae jehra adhi ratien*

*Saada booha kharka rea ae?*

*Aeiy koe rahgeer te nh?*

*Aeiy koe chor ten h*

*Aeiy koe gawaandi te nh?*



*Jaan per aeiy aes basti da*

*Saanjha chokidar te nh*

*Jinu assaan lishkani banduq*

*Le k diti si*

*Par jehra saade hi seene te*

*Banduq rakh k*

*Saahnu gharon kadhan lae aaya ae* (Arif, ed. 1995, 51)

Who is this? Who at midnight

Is knocking at our door?

Is this a traveler?

Is this a thief?

Is this a neighbor?

Or is this the watchman?

Of this town

To whom we have given

The shining gun

And now he

With the same gun

Pointing to our chest has come

To drive us out of our home

Sara Shugufta, a rebellious voice of the time, in a taunting way pens down the distrust in her poem, *Mein Nangi Changi*.

*Mein nangi change*

*Mein tere waste lahu de deeve bale nien*

*Te apniyan poran de saare raaz*

*Lokan vich vand dite nien*

*Mein apniyan poran vand vand k*

*Tere sang meil banae nein*

*Fer v mere badan di dalali karn wale*

*Tenu mera naan nh dasde* (Arif, ed. 1995, 36)

I'm fine being naked

I lit the flames of blood for your sake

Then the whole secrets of my bosom

I shared with the people

By sharing my bosom

I made my relation with you

Even then the people who sold my body

Don't tell you the name of mine

To conclude, it may be suggested that the bulk of literature which was written by many Punjabi poets in resistance to Zia regime somehow in one way or the other highlights the common themes of resistance. This is because resistance literature has a direct link with the soil and the people living on that soil. It can never be created in an unreal world. It might have a touch of imagination but it is always beached on reality because it comes to life with words coined in the mintage of society. The purpose of the writers in writing resistance literature is to inspire the masses to celebrate their indigenous traditions, identity, liberty, nationalism, racism, ideology and religion. For these poets, literature is

not only apolitical but a significant political phenomenon and it has a strong relation with power and politics.

## Reference

---

- Alexander Pope, tr. *The Iliad of Homer* (New York: Macmillan Company, 1965)
- Alfred W. Pollard, ed. *Chaucer The Prologue* (London: Macmillan & Co Ltd, 1960)
- Christopher Shackle, *Bulleh ShahSufi Lyrics* (London: Harvard University Press, 2015)
- Douglas Bush, ed. *Milton: Poetical Works* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1966)
- Douglas Grant, ed. & Sel. *Poems of Alexander Pope* (London: Penguin Books, 1950)
- Fakhar Zaman & Hafizur Rehman, ed. *Resistance Literature* (Islamabad: Pakistan Academy of Letters, 2009)
- G.M.A. Grube, tr. *Plato, the Trial and Death of Socrates* (Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company, 1975)
- H.M. Rosenberg, ed. *Counterpoint: An Anthology of Modern Poetry* (San Francisco: Idlewild)
- Ian C. Storey & Arlene Allen, *A Guide to Ancient Greek Drama* (Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2005)
- Iftikhar Arif, ed. *Mazahmati Adab: Punjabi* (Islamabad: Pakistan Academy of Letters, 1995)
- John R. Hale, *Renaissance* (New York: Time Inc, 1965)
- Menahem Mansoor, ed. *Wisdom from the Ancients* (Madison: University of Wisconsin-Madison, 2001)
- Michael Grant, *A Social History of Greece and Rome* (New York: Macmillan Company, 1992) (Spartacus started with 200 gladiators, of whom 78 made a successful break. He wanted to fight in order to get his men back to their homelands.)
- Rashid Amjad, ed. *Mazahmati Adab: Urdu* (Islamabad: Pakistan Academy of Letters, 1995)
- Sami ur Rahman, tr. *The Rubaiyat of Khushal Khan Khattak* (Islamabad: Rainbow Graphics, 2016)
- Shafqat Tanveer Mirza, *Resistance Themes in Punjabi Literature* (Lahore: Sang-e-Meel Publications, 1992)
- Shuja Nawaz, *Crossed Swords: Pakistan, its Army, and the Wars Within* (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2008)

---

**The Politics of Indigenoussness of Med Fisherfolk of Pakistan:**

**Their Cultural Rights in Perspective**

**Tuba Azeem**

**Victoria University of Wellington**

**Abstract**

Med of the coastal districts of Gwadar and Lasbela of the Balochistan province of Pakistan comprises a social class with fisherfolk from different backgrounds. They have a subordinate and mostly subaltern position within the Baloch social and cultural hierarchy, dominated by landowners, wealthy boat owners, and notables locally known as Mirs and Kahodas. Overall, they are ranked among the many marginalized and underrepresented communities of Pakistan while considered arguably indigenous to the region. Their cultural rights are interrupted due to acquisition of their ancestral land territories to build and protect developmental projects by the state agencies. It has put at risk their cultural identities and stewardship to the coastal habitat and the Arabian Sea. This article provides the context of their land dispossession and explains their distinct affiliation to the coastal Makran and the Arabian Sea. It suggests at the end an integrated coastal policy to establish cultural institutions raising awareness about their rich heritage, monuments, and maritime customs, dating back thousands of years.

---

*Keywords:* Med, Fisherfolk, Indigenous Peoples, Coastal Makran, Arabian Sea, Balochistan, Culture, Land Laws, Sea Rights, Coastal Communities.

---

### **The Politics of Indigenous Land**

Cultural rights are usually listed down with economic and social rights and consists of equal rights to cultural identity, housing, livelihood, education, and health care (International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 1966). In essence, they all mean to promise and protect human dignity. For Med in this article, their cultural rights are discussed in terms of their freedom to protect their traditional land territories where they have lived for generations and their inherent right to profess their culture and religion that is rooted in their unique coastal habitat. Their cultural rights embody land and sea rights and affords them distinct identities of seafarers and fisherfolk.

Possession of land, its use, acquisition, and transfer are constitutionally guaranteed fundamental rights. However, in Pakistan government usually confiscates this right in lieu of developmental excuses prominently known as the megaprojects (Delphine et al., 2019). For instance, the Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan under article 23 protects the interests of private entities purchasing land historically possessed by the indigenous communities. While article 24 restricts acquisition and possession of such a land without compensation and creates an exception when there is a matter of public interest. Pakistan has ventured into several projects of such kind since her inception, like the construction of the Islamabad Capital Territory, Motorway and Expressways, the Sialkot International Airport, Neelum Jhelum Hydro-Electric Project, Nandipur Power Project, Port development projects in Gwadar, Bin Qasim and Karachi, and criticized



over their spillover effects notably mass displacements and involuntary land dispossessions (Rizvi, 2018). While connotations like land acquisitions or resource grabbing, illegal evictions, land or resources expropriation, involuntary or forced land dispossession, land exploitation are referred to state authorities or security agencies restricting or limiting the access to land and resources of indigenous peoples in their ancestral territories to pursue legally protected ways of life or pushing them out of their traditional areas to give way for the large scale development that tend to destroy their culture and lives.

For the last decade, the media has significantly projected the condition of fisherfolk in Gwadar and most of the local coastal population in Balochistan. They sold properties to the security agencies and the China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) while multiple checkpoints are interrupting the day-to-day mobility of fisherfolk to the beach (Shahrukh et al., 2020). The private sector is rushing to buy the properties, for example, the Rafi Group is developing a real estate project, approved by the Gwadar Development Authority, located on the major artery of Gwadar, the Makran Coastal Highway, known as Green Palms Gwadar, akin to the megalopolis of Shenzhen – the city upon which Gwadar’s development is based. Many fisherfolk in Gwadar have migrated to the nearby coastal towns, and others have lost complete access to the beach. The remaining fisherfolk on the coast anticipate a similar fate. Their apprehensions concerns the loss of habitat, cultural identity, and livelihood due to the developmental projects.

---

### **The Ethnography of Med Fisherfolk**

The coastline of Balochistan is about 750km long (comprises about 70% of the country's total 1,001 kilometers long coastline) and divided into the districts of Lasbela (178km) and Gwadar (600km). Lasbela's population was 574,292, according to the latest census conducted in 2017. It has nine tehsils (sub-divisions). Four out of them – Gadani, Hub, Sonmiani and Liari – are coastal tehsils. The population is generally organized on a tribal basis, with Alyani and Bhootani as the two significant tribes. The chief of the Alyani tribe, the Jam of Lasbela, traditionally dominates all other tribes and ruled the area before the creation of Pakistan and to an extent (de facto) even now. The Bhootanis also have considerable influence in the region. A current member of the National Assembly (MNA) is also from the Bhootani tribe. The majority of the population is considered ethnically Baloch. Around 65% of its population speaks Balochi and 24% speak Lasi (a dialect of Sindhi). Most of the population is Sunni, and there is also some presence of Zikris in the area. Zikri is a sect/cult that is not organized on a tribal basis but is led by spiritual leaders known as *Khwajas*.

The census of 2017 recorded Gwadar's population as 263,514. It has four coastal tehsils, namely Ormara, Pasni, Gwadar and Jiwani. The population of district Gwadar is also ethnically Baloch and speaks Balochi. In Gwadar, there are clans and local notables, but there is no tribal hierarchy as such. However, the spiritual leaders of the Zikri sect in Gwadar district seem to have a considerable traditional influence on their

followers. The population of Gwadar by and large comprises fisherfolk (*Med*), and unlike Lasbela district, there is no largescale agriculture or industrial activity.

Med are found in present-day coastal towns of Balochistan; Jiwani, Peshukan, Surbandar, Gwadar, Churbandar, Pasni, Kalamat, Ormara, Kund Malir, Damb/Sonmiani, Gaddani, and Goth Haji Alano. The word Med is often considered a derogatory term and refers to fish-eaters, who are considered excellent seafarers and fishermen of the coastal region of Makran. Inseparable from the sea, they are impressive navigators with the knowledge of stars, winds, and maritime seasons (Badalkhan, 2006). Med live entirely on the proceeds of fish-catch. Even their livestock eat the skin of fish as fodder. Their contact with the sea takes place as early as seven or eight years of age, and they spend weeks, sometimes even months, in the sea (Badalkhan, 2006).

They speak Makrani, a dialect of Persian and Balochi, and locally known as *buni* or *asli* (indigenous or inborn). Badalkhan revealed five different opinions on the origin of Med; “(1) they are the indigenous population of the coast whom the Greeks termed as the *Ichthyophagi* or Fish-eaters; (2) they have migrated from the Indus valley sometime around the eleventh and twelfth centuries; (3) they are related to the Medes, a denomination of a people or region of pre-Achaemenid and Achaemenid northwestern Iran; (4) they are Indian by origin and related to the untouchable people called Meda; (5) their ancestors migrated from Dadhar and Kacchi areas of northeastern Balochistan” (Badalkhan, 2006). One of the popular opinions on the indigenous of *Med* places them as

non-Baloch, aboriginals, who were the early settlers of the coastal region of Makran. They were the first sea-going people of Asia and the most dreaded pirates of the Eastern seas.

Med might be among the aboriginal ethnic groups of the coastal region of Makran. However, many people from interior Balochistan and other parts of the country have entered the fishing profession. When outsiders adopted fishing as an occupation, they also received the label of Med. However, Med has a subordinate position within the Baloch social hierarchy, along with other working-class people. For instance, Hafeez Jamali, Director of Balochistan Archives, writes that “Med occupy a lower position in the local social hierarchy dominated by landowners, wealthy boat owners, and local big men (Mirs and Kahodas)” (Jamali, 2014, p. 5).

### **The Justiciability of Cultural Rights**

In *Ghulam Rasool vs. Government of Pakistan* [1978 PLD 40] a simple matter of admission to an Engineering College in Quetta had the court investigated, who is entitled to a “domicile certificate” and who qualifies for a “local certificate” as a bona fide resident of Balochistan. A person who has lived for at least 12 years in the province and has completed Matriculation, Intermediate, and Bachelor from academic institutions of Balochistan, is entitled to a domicile certificate. While bona fide residents are those people (i) who belong to any indigenous tribe of the province, (ii) their forefathers had settled in the province for time immemorial, and (iii) who have been declared by the

government as such from time to time. Even their temporary settlement in other provinces for reasons to pursue livelihood or weather patterns do not exclude them from enjoying the status of *bonda fide* residents. However, the majority of Med do not have ownership titles of their lands or the residency certificates. For the very reason, they are apprehending displacements and fear losing their coastal habitat and livelihood, and means to profess and celebrate their culture and transfer to next generations the stewardship of their ancestral land territories and the sea.

While the issue of recognition of minorities and indigenous peoples in Pakistan goes far back to the colonial days as Islam was presented as *raison d'être* to the creation of Pakistan. All ethnic, racial, linguistic, and cultural differences were waved aside as insignificant (Ali & Rehman, 2013). The Constitution accepts under article 25 religious minorities and does not discriminate citizens based on caste, creed, ethnicity, or language. However, there is special recognition for the religious minorities under article 20. The judiciary in Pakistan had previously and continue to engage on the periphery with the idea of indigenous or tribal affiliation or granting them any special socio-cultural rights. However, Pakistan is signatory to several international human rights instruments including International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, International Convention on Civil and Political Rights, Convention on the Rights of the Child, and International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination. Recognition of Med as an indigenous people with distinct language, culture, and

---

occupational identities must be reconsidered under the national policies and laws. Med are the direct recipients of the mega projects and should be included as critical stakeholders.

### **Conclusion**

It rounds the discussion that cultural rights of the Med fisherfolk are directly affiliated with their historic affiliation to the region and demand intensive scrutiny and revision under the international instruments. If acquisitions are necessary to strategic instalments for the CPEC, an independent authority must look after the purchases, compensation, and rehabilitation processes. Furthermore, the international entities involved in the mega projects must adopt a rights-based approach to financing them in Pakistan, allowing participation of the Med fisherfolk and demonstrate respect for their culture, traditions, customs, and traditional knowledge. Because when such agreements are negotiated without the local population's involvement and information, they are at odds with international law. Moreover, in Pakistan, the Ministry of Culture and affiliated departments should work on Med fisherfolk, showcasing their cultural practices and navigational techniques, and facilitate access to the Med archives in the community centres and pop-up museums. To strengthen Pakistan's maritime border, the people and the government need to provide care for the coastal communities and establish a communication protocol with the help of municipalities and local representative bodies of Med. United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous People, 2007 of which

---

Pakistan is a signatory made an attempt to recognize and uplift communities who endorse their unique cultural identities and have the determination to profess and transfer their traditional knowledge, language, and customs to their predecessors. Together with the United Nations Permanent Forum on Indigenous Issues, Pakistan can set parameters for international entities wishing to invest in the coastal region of Balochistan to negotiate agreements with Med and obtain their free, prior and informed consent to kick-start a megaproject.

---

## References

- Ali, S. S., & Rehman, J. (2013). *Indigenous Peoples and ethnic minorities of Pakistan: Constitutional and legal perspectives*. Routledge.
- Badalkhan, S. (2006). On the Med Fishermen of Coastal Makran. *Ravenna*, II, 286–306.
- Badalkhan, S. (2000). Portuguese Encounters with Coastal Makran Baloch during the Sixteenth Century. Some References from a Balochi Heroic Epic. *Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society*, 10(2), 153–169.
- Delphine, Witte, P., & Spit, T. (2019). Megaprojects – An anatomy of perception. *The Planning Review*, 55(2), 63-77. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02513625.2019.1630189>
- Jamali, H. (2014). *A harbor in the tempest: megaprojects, identity, and the politics of place in Gwadar, Pakistan* [Doctoral dissertation]. <https://repositories.lib.utexas.edu/handle/2152/30322>
- Rizvi, K. (2018, October 25). Who pays the price for mega projects in Pakistan? *DAWN*. <https://www.dawn.com/news/1441265>
- Shahrukh, N., Hussain, S., Azeem, T., & Khan, S. (2020). Coastal communities of Balochistan Vis-à-Vis CPEC: Mapping perceptions and socioeconomic issues. *Policy Perspectives*, 17(1), 53. <https://doi.org/10.13169/polipers.17.1.0053>



---

## **Conceptualizing Change: Fair and Lovely to Glow and Lovely**

**Qurat-ul-Ain**

**Foundation University Rawalpindi Campus**

### **Abstract**

Ideologies play a major part in our society. They help us in creating our society. Language has the power to mold and change these ideologies. This study is focused on the famous fairness cream fair and lovely and its promotion of stereotypical beliefs associated with beauty. The research has taken in the advertisements of last 20 years of the fairness cream, Fair and Lovely. In the modern age advertisements are the best way to persuade people into changing their ideologies. They are assessable to everyone and everywhere. The advertisements clearly show a significant transition in ideologies reflecting societal beliefs. The advertisements selected are one of the most famous advertisements of that time. The society was made to believe that a fair person can be most successful in life. This ideology was created by Fair and lovely. It shows how they have used language to change the old and stagnant ideologies of society. The theoretical and methodological framework of this study is taken from Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) of Fairclough. The Fairclough 3D model (1989 and 1995). The study shows how the brand has used the power of language to create a completely different ideology.

---

**Keywords:** Fairness cream, Fair and lovely advertisement, beauty, change, ideologies, Fairclough, Critical discourse Analysis, language, power

### **Conceptualizing Change**

The main effort to influence, convenience, and the target customers is made by the advertisements. They exaggerated the facts easily persuade the buyer. They use words that are appealing to their targeted audiences. They target the emotions of people. They tend to compare fairness with something mystical and beautiful. In the majority of the Asian countries, it is now a cultural, social and financial aspect to have fair skin. The dark skin is no more desirable or attractive. It also gives the person more chances in society. The person has more chances of getting married to someone better and well off just because of the skin color (Traore A, et al 2005).

They consider it as a cultural marker for their social status class and worth. By worth, it means the wealth they have. The fairer the person surplus of this to be found (Dadzie O, Petit 2009). The significant player in this field is the advertising industry. They have also helped in building this stereotypical thought among the people. This increasing demand has opened the field for international players to play their game on a wider field. Furthermore, the celebrities' endorsements of these products have also played a vital role in their marketing. Famous actors like Sonam Kapoor, Shah Rukh Khan, John Abraham, and Katrina Kaif are brand ambassadors for major fairness cream, i.e. L'Oréal, Grainer, Olay, Pounds etc.

---

### **Methodology**

The objective of this research is to study the ideologies developed about fairness creams through commercials. It also addresses the research question of these advertisements reflect the stereotypical ideologies concerning the concept of beauty over the 20 years? The research has applied the Three-dimensional model of Critical Discourse Analysis. It is one of the most renowned frameworks for research in CDA. This model consists of three interrelated processes of analysis. It includes 3 steps of analysis which are text analysis, interpretation and explanation. The use of these 3 are surely to be linked with the individual analysis. The framework develops a connection between different disciplines and themes of research. It analyses the text in every level. Starting from the basic textual structure. Than moving towards the relation of the text with the researcher and the knowledge. The research is taking into account the advertisements of one brand from the last 20 years and the transformation of ideological beliefs and stereotypes associated with the concept of beauty. They are compared to the latest advertisement where Fair and lovely. The research is qualitative. 5 advertisements are selected from year 2000 to 2020.

### **Literature Review**

The concept of fairness beauty creams has become a necessity for the Indian youth (Das ,2013). This has given a hike to their sales. Watson 2010, stated the caste and color system has placed the tan people on a lower level as compared to the fair people. They

have divided the people into levels. On the top are the Caucasians, then are the people who have light skin tone, the lowest are the people who have the darkest color. The people are treated according to their skin color (Watson , 2010). According to some researchers, the fairness creams play with the emotion of the people. It is not the advertisement that encourages the people but the feeling associated with it. They target the emotional side of people and then use to increase their demand. The feeling is then confused with the signifier/signified (Willimason ,1978). A research has highlighted the use of societal pressure is targeted by the manufacture of the creams. They make the people believe that without fair skin they are useless and have less or no chances of being accepted (Jha, 2016). Over time technology has also played a role in fairness creams. They with the use of technology now guarantee more promising and long-lasting results. It gives the user a more desirable and empowered personality that cannot be achieved with the use of fairness creams.

#### Analysis of commercials

1. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=TFI6H5hz80o>

#### **Theme of advertisement:**

In this commercial, there is a wedding going on. There is a boy who seems to be acting like a palmist. He is surrounded by girls. He sees hand of a fair girl and falls for her. The girl blushes away. Her friend tells her that is very fair and pretty. The girl tells her it's because of Fair and lovely. The boy later confesses his love to her.

---

**Text Analysis:**

This ad is presented by “fair and lovely”. It is related to the “Advertisement domain”. It persuades them that without the use of their product they are useless. To achieve anything in life they need to use their product. It shatters their confidence. The discourse of the advertisement revolves around arrangement and commitment. This is considered as an institutional practice. The vocabulary used revolves around being pretty and fair. One of the most dominant elements is of marriage and for that attraction is a basic necessity. There is also a need for an energetic handsome male character.

**Interpretation:**

This is culturally oriented and reflects the interest of people. Man is a social animal. He can't live in isolation. Therefore, he gets married. They love their family, friends, dear ones etc. The ceremony of marriage is done with their family, friends, and relatives. Whenever someone visits their families, and friends for a marriage proposal they look for the best girl. The best definition of a pretty girl would be the fair one. Any girl without a fair complexion would never feel confident enough. In the advertisement, it can be observed that no one in the surround of the girl had no objection to the use of cream.

2. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=fesMACX99fU>

**Theme of advertisement:**

---

In this commercial 2 friends who happen to be from the film industry meet. One actress compliments the other over her fair complexion and assumes that is because she got married. But then the actress corrects her by telling her it is because of Fair and lovely.

**Text Analysis:**

The advertisement has bought in light the celebrities. They have used them as tools to persuade people to buy their product. The discourse of celebrities is widespread and people comprehend it more. They have used hidden power to persuade people into buying their product. The language of the advertisement is English. There is happy music going on in the background.

**Interpretation:**

The advertisement has celebrity endorsement. Which makes it very popular. They have minimally focused on other aspects. They have used their discourse to sell their product. There are no extra people in the advertisement. The music doesn't change much. The celebrities have admired each other because of the use of the cream. Now people would believe that they use the product and buy the product.

**Explanation of 1 and 2:**

This is the true picture of our society, how strong the relationship between two families is based on skin tone. The culture of our society makes us believe that without being fair a girl is not pretty. Such thoughts are deeply embedded in our society. People now assume it to be normal. Although it is also a known fact that the people of the subcontinent are

not fair. They have a tan wheat shade of skin. This is normal for people living here. But because of the British rule and influence of the west, we now don't assume it to be normal. They have also added celebrities' in the race for a stronger discourse. They believe this way they can use their stardom to sell their product.

Furthermore, analyzing the advertisement in terms of religious beliefs. Allah has created us all perfectly. There is nothing less in us that needs to be improved. A person needs to focus on inner beauty and not on appearance. As appearances can be misleading.

3. [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=\\_ZneY\\_dKHY4](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=_ZneY_dKHY4)

**Theme of advertisement:**

In this commercial everyone seems to be very happy. A girl comes in and congratulates her friend upon getting the modeling contract but the girl is unhappy. Because of applying cold creams, she has lost her fair complexion. The girl gives her fair and lovely she applies it and gets fair and confident.

**Text Analysis:**

This ad states the interest and needs of individuals. It persuades them that without the use of their product they are useless. To achieve anything in life they need to use their product. It shatters their confidence. According to society, only a fair girl can achieve her dreams. Everyone wants to see a pretty girl. The girl who is fair and pretty would get the contract. The music indicates saddens but when the girl finally uses Fair and Lovely the

---

Music changes to happiness and acceptance. One can instantly guess through music that girl got what she wanted.

**Interpretation:**

This ad is particularly associated with the advertisement domain and presented by fair and lovely following social practices are also there. Man needs acceptance and attention from the people around him. For this purpose, they use the product. They have highlighted the issue of girls stepping out and working.

4. [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=J\\_2epVPHjII](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=J_2epVPHjII)

**Theme of advertisement:**

In this commercial, the girl is seen admiring a diamond. She complements the diamond by saying it is spotless, shiny, bright. A girl joins her and repeats when she is saying to her instead of the diamond. She then asks whether she had some treatment for her skin. Fair and lovely introduces crystal white beauty now.

**Text Analysis:**

This ad puts in spotlights the interest and needs of individuals. The advertisement here is telling the viewers that there is nothing better than being the fairest of all. They have used a diamond to compare to a girl. Diamond is still considered as the most precious stone of all times. Discourse is used as a tool for attracting and convincing people toward their product. The use of phrases such as “crystal bright beauty cream” to capture the attention



---

of the buyers. The vocabulary used revolves around being pretty, flawless, and fair. There is a happy empowering music going on in the background. The music indicated happiness.

**Interpretation:**

This ad is particularly associated with the advertisement domain and presented by fair and lovely following social practices are also there. This is culturally oriented and reflects the interest of people. The girl is in awe by seeing the perfect complexion of the other girl. Which has only happened because of the use of fair and lovely. They have moved away from the concept of marriage and success and only focusing on their product. This one the most prominent changes in fair and lovely.

**Explanation of 3 and 4:**

This is the true picture of our society, how strong relationship career opportunities are based on skin tone. The culture of our society makes us believe that without being fair a girl is not pretty. Such thoughts are deeply embedded in our society. People now assume it to be normal. Now that they have added this new discourse to the same old thing just to make it a bit more interesting and new. They still have the same motto. Although it is also a known fact that the people of the subcontinent are not fair. They have a tan wheat shade of skin. This is normal for people living here. But because of the British rule and influence of the west, we now don't assume it to be normal.

5. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=NSq4yi86v-o>

**Theme of advertisement:**

This is the latest song of fair and lovely. It starts with saying celebrating the diverse and glowing faces of Pakistan. In this, they have admired that all skin colors equally pretty and you just need to have clear skin. In this song, they have shown different independent women. All of them seem to be pursuing their career.

**Text Analysis:**

This ad is about a well-known old and famous fairness cream. This advertisement stands out of all the advertisements that have been presented by Fair and lovely. They are talking about women empowerment here. They start with the new slogan of Glow and lovely “celebrating the diverse and glowing faces of Pakistan”. They have completely removed the word Fair from their discourse. The vocabulary used revolves around being powerful and successful. One of the most dominant elements is of being independent is used for attraction is a basic necessity. There is no male character in the advertisement. The new anthem which they have named their song is promoting all skin tones of women. The first line starts as ‘Mitti kay sow rang hai, Ek rang ma Ek rang tu..’ this makes the women believe that they all are together despite a different skin tone.

**Interpretation:**

This advertisement is considered a new theme song for Fair and lovely. It has presented a new social image of the product. For the past 19 years, it had been preaching the idea of being fair. It is a new social ideology. Man keeps learning and changing. They have created an independent image of women. Women in cricket or photography they have

---

reached new heights. But this still doesn't mean they have forgotten their cultural values. They have not taken any celebrity in the advertisement but have picked up the faces that need acceptance in society. The advertisement has been shoot in local places and not inset.

**Explanation:**

This is a superficial image of society. We cannot still accept not being fair. It is also a fact that now it is accepted normal for women to choose fields that were once alien to them. They can now play on the fields. Go on rounds of the country and world to take pictures. This advertisement has made women very strong. They have their rights now. They have stepped out in the world to face it. These thoughts and ideas are still not deeply embedded in our society. People are still trying to accept it as normal. We here as one class of the world have accepted it to be normal.

**Discussion**

The study was done to see how power is used to shape ideologies. They have very consistently conveyed their idea of fair skin. Celebrating the diversity of beauty. That's why we're removing the words 'fairness', 'whitening' & 'lightening' from products, and changing the Fair & Lovely brand name. To explain the relationship between power and discourse we need to look at the work of language and power, where the distinction between power in discourse and power behind discourse is elaborated. It is emphasized that power is never definitively held by any one person, or social grouping, because

---

power can be won and exercised only in and through social struggles in which it may also be lost. Advertising subtly distorts reality and manipulates the people to make them buy a way of life. Due to cutting-through competition in the world fair and lovely has changed its motto now. It now believes that a person doesn't need to be fair to be accepted in society. This change in discourse is done over the years. They first shifted their discourse from marriage and acceptance of man to career. The women didn't want to have fair skin to persuade their dreams, they want to be accepted the way they are. So in 2020 fair and lovely changed its name to Glow and lovely. Fair and lovely is exercising a new ideology with the help of discourse.

### **Conclusion**

Critical Discourse analysis has played a vital role in giving meaning to the voice of people. With the emergence of media this aim is more achievable. Now it is easy to convince people towards a new ideology. The power is now hidden in the text rather than being evident. Glow and lovely now believes that It now believes that every woman needs to be spotless and perfect. This is the new motto that they are carrying forward. In a world where there is so much pressure to be number one. Fair and lovely is exercising a new ideology with the help of discourse. It has readily accepted the change and is looking forward to welcoming it. However, ironically the concept of fair skin is widely accepted by the norms of Pakistani social structure and moral values of the society.

---

## References

- Burger, Burger.P. (2016). "Skin Whitening Cosmetics: Feedback and Challenges in the Development of Natural Skin Lighteners" cosmetics 3(30)
- Dadzie O, Petit A. Skin bleaching: highlighting the misuse of cutaneous depigmenting agents. J. Eur Acad Dermatol Venereol (2009) 23:741–50.10.1111/j.1468-3083.2009.03150.x
- Das S. (2013). "Consumers Perception on Fairness Cream in India", Journal of Research, Extension and Development, 1(11) 64-66.
- Hammond A, Prahalad CK. 2014. Selling to the poor. Foreign Policy May–June: 30–37.
- Jha B. (2016) "Representation of fair-skin beauty and the female consumer" IOSR Journal Of Humanities And Social Science, 21(2) PP 01-12.
- Luce E, Merchant K. 2003. India orders ban on advert saying fairer equals better for women. Financial Times 20 March.
- Sarkar & Gosh (2017) "Ethical norms in fairness cream advertisements", Global Media Journal – Indian Edition, 7(2)
- Traore A, Kadeba JC, Niamba P, Barro F, Ouedraogo L. Use of cutaneous depigmenting products by women in two towns in Burkina Faso: epidemiologic data, motivations, products and side effects. Int J Dermatol (2005)
- Williamson J (1978). Decoding advertisements: Ideology and meaning in advertising.